Purpose, Priority, Process

Determine why you're responding:
What's your goal?
What's your role?

Determine what matters:
What does the assignment emphasize?
What do you and/or the field value?

Consider the stage:
What draft is this?
What can the writer do with my comments?
Best Practices

- The Critique Sandwich (Vitamin P)
- Formative vs. Summative
- Connective/Connected comments
- Read as a Reader (Assessment without Teachers)
- Higher-Order Concerns and Lower-Order Concerns (Macro and Micro level response)

Best practices vary among assignments and writers.
Best practices vary among assignments and writers.
Considerations

Teacher and Student Language(s)
Facilitate Problem-Solving
Patterns, not Errors
Questions and Commands
Analytic or Holistic
Project Proposal

Problem Statement:

Penn State’s Biobehavioral Health department is interested in the outcome of a cultural awareness assessment project conducted at Pine Ridge Public Health Hospital. The researcher will give a presentation to the Biobehavioral Health faculty detailing the methodology and results of the assessment, and the rationale for the cultural orientation packet based on the results. The researcher will benefit from the review and critique by the faculty, and the faculty will be exposed to the results of the project.

Problem and Context:

Researchers share their findings both to educate their colleagues and to strengthen their research techniques with peer feedback. Undergraduate researchers, in particular, need the advice of their technical community to help develop their skills. The Biobehavioral Health department at Penn State has requested that I present findings from a cultural awareness assessment project I conducted on five Lakota reservations in South Dakota during the summer of 1998.

Two measures of cultural awareness were used to assess the physicians: physician questionnaires and patient interviews. The questionnaires were carefully structured to evaluate three facets of physician cultural

Great details, concisely stated. Now, argue for their significance. Why do the faculty need to hear your presentation?

Here's an idea to expand on. Why are they interested? How does your work contribute to the field (fill a gap in knowledge)?

Go ahead and use "to" here, as you did in the rest of the proposal.

From our talks, I understand that this is not actually your situation, right? You face a more common situation that would be useful to explore because it is the same situation faced by expert researchers who must request that their articles be published or that they be given a chance to speak at a conference.
Qualifications:

A combination of research and practical experience qualifies me to present the results of the cultural awareness assessment to the Biobehavioral Health faculty. First, three years as a student in the Biobehavioral Health department has made me intimately familiar with the needs of the faculty audience. Second, I am the Principal Investigator in charge of the cultural awareness assessment project at Pine Ridge Indian Reservation. Since I have spent nearly eighteen months designing, executing, and analyzing the cultural awareness of IHS medical staff, I have a thorough appreciation for the nuances of the project. Having lived and worked as part of the Caucasian minority of Pine Ridge Indian Reservation, I have a practical, as well as academic, appreciation of the need for cross-cultural communication in reservations hospitals.

Lauren—

Your proposal is approved. You clearly demonstrate an understanding of your position within your disciplinary community, and you have identified several widely accepted methods of boosting credibility within that community. Your proposal gives me confidence that you will be able to use conventions to create a presentation that demonstrates membership in your community. You can also use disciplinary conventions to develop a strong purpose for your presentation. The "knowledge gap" problem-statement form might serve you well. My marginal comments offer some suggestions for ways to present your work as filling a gap. Remember that purpose derives from your audience's problems, not your own. See yourself as contributing knowledge to your field, for you do in fact have a strong contribution to make!
### Breakfast in Bed: Holistic Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>All food is perfectly cooked, presentation surpasses expectations, and recipient is kept exceptionally comfortable throughout the meal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Food is cooked correctly, the meal is presented in a clean and well-organized manner, and the recipient is kept comfortable throughout the meal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some food is cooked poorly, some aspects of presentation are sloppy or unclean, or the recipient is uncomfortable at times.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Most of the food is cooked poorly, the presentation is sloppy or unclean, and the recipient is uncomfortable most of the time.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Breakfast in Bed: Analytic Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Beginning 1</th>
<th>Developing 2</th>
<th>Accomplished 3</th>
<th>Exemplary 4</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food</strong></td>
<td>Most food is colder or warmer than it should be, is under- or over-seasoned, or is under- or overcooked</td>
<td>Some food is colder or warmer than it should be, is under- or over-seasoned, or is under- or overcooked</td>
<td>All food is at the correct temperature, adequately seasoned, and cooked to the eater’s preference</td>
<td>All food is perfectly cooked and seasoned to the eater’s preference. Additional condiments are offered.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation</strong></td>
<td>More than one item (tray, napkin, or silverware) are dirty or missing</td>
<td>Tray, napkin or silverware may be dirty or missing</td>
<td>Food is served on a clean tray, with napkin and silverware. Some decorative additions may be present</td>
<td>Food is served on a clean tray, with napkin and silverware. Several decorative touches are added.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comfort</strong></td>
<td>Wake-up is abrupt, little to no help with seating, and the recipient is rushed and crowded during the meal.</td>
<td>Wake-up is somewhat abrupt, recipient may struggle with seat adjustment, or there may be some rushing or crowding during eating.</td>
<td>Recipient is woken gently, assisted in seat adjustment, and given reasonable time and space to eat.</td>
<td>Recipient is woken gently and lovingly, assisted until seating is just right, and given abundant time and space to eat.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Online Resources

- Colorado State University Writing Studio. "Finding Resources in your Discipline- Starting Points for Commenting on Student Writing." [URL: http://writing.colostate.edu/guides/teaching/commenting/discipline.cfm]

- Elbow, Peter. “About Responding to Student Writing.” [URL: https://www.marist.edu/writingcenter/pdfs/respond.pdf]


Write from the Start
QEP Faculty Outcomes

The NSU QEP will seek to change the culture surrounding the emphasis on writing within the university. To that end, it is expected that demonstrable change will occur for faculty members across several domains. Specifically, faculty member outcomes will include:

1. increased knowledge and use of writing resources by faculty and staff (writing support services)
2. increased participation in writing workshops designed to assist faculty members in providing writing-related feedback to students (pedagogical support)
3. increased meaningful, strategic, and productive feedback to student writing that is appropriate to the stage of writing (rough draft or finished product) and that provides strategies for revision

nova.edu/QEP